Appendix D
Evaluation Criteria and Checklist for Presentation and Paper on Recent Research on the Cellular Biology of Human Disease

Part of presentation	Criteria	Excellent	Very good	Good	Average	Poor
In-class Presentation: Research Paper						
Introduction	**Set stage for talk; give necessary background; give take-home message.**					
	Were the group members introduced and their roles in the presentation given?					
	How well was the information placed in context of general biology and/or health, economy, etc.?					
	Was the "take-home" message clearly given?					
	Why was the experiment done? Why was this project chosen?					
	How was the experiment done? How was the project done (BASIC information)?					
	What did the experiment show? What did you learn in your studies?					
	Was it clear how the remainder of the talk would progress (can be outline or just stated)?					
Methods	**Explain in sufficient detail how experiment was carried out.**					
	Were the methods used clearly described?					
	Were the reagents described?					
	Were all terms defined?					
	Is it clear that the presenters understand the techniques?					
Results	**Recount what you learned during your analysis of the paper.**					
	Was the information provided in small, logical steps?					
	Were the controls pointed out?					
	Was the result of each experiment summarized?					

Part of presentation	Criteria	Excellent	Very good	Good	Average	Poor
Conclusion, Summary	**Repeat take-home message; point out problems that are not yet resolved; give perspective and look to future.**					
	Was the overall take-home message repeated					
	Were shortcomings of the experiment pointed out?					
	Were one or two questions for future experiments given?					
Above and Beyond: Exceptional presentations.						
	Was any novel approach or interesting anecdote given that would help the audience remember this subject?					
Overheads/Demos, etc.						
	Were overheads legible and easy to follow?					
	Was the main topic clearly stated on the overhead?					

Part of report	Criteria	Excellent	Very good	Good	Average	Poor
Reports/Handouts: Research Paper						
General						
	Were the roles of each group member described?					
	Was the report divided into appropriate sections (Introduction, Methods, Results, and Conclusions)?					
	Was the report well written?					
	Was the writing clear and to the point?					
	Was jargon avoided?					
	Were topic sentences clearly present in each paragraph?					
	Did each sentence relate to the prior sentence and look forward to the next (i.e., was the flow of the writing appropriate?)?					

Part of report	Criteria	Excellent	Very good	Good	Average	Poor
	Did the report include critical evaluations of the information?					
	Did the report include all references?					
	Was the report forward looking (i.e., were problems that remain, challenges for future researchers, etc., pointed out?)?					
	Was the discussion log properly maintained? (Reports without a log will not be graded.)					
	Did each member of the group turn in evaluations of group participation? (Grades will not be given until these evaluations are received.)					
Above & Beyond	**Did anything make this report stand out from others?**					
	Describe below and rate to right:					

Current Research Presentation Checklist
Presentation and Papers on Wednesday, August 8–Thursday, August 9

	Question	Answer	Check
Paper	When is it due?	The completed paper is due at the beginning of class on Wednesday. I need BOTH a hard copy and a floppy (or CD or Zip).	
	How long it can be?	Paper should be ABOUT 5 pages long, single spaced, 12-point font, 1-inch margins. It CAN be longer if necessary—I will read everything you turn in and count it for your grade. The references and any figures do not count in the page total.	
	What is the format?	The paper should be divided into clearly marked sections, corresponding to the evaluation checklist and to the parts of your talk. You can modify the checklist to reflect your particular organization or topics.	
	How do I indicate who wrote which parts?	The paper must include information about who wrote which sections. You can put the name of the author in parentheses after the heading.	
	What about references?	ALL references must be included, including web-based references. You should have MORE than JUST text or web references. I estimate that you should have about 10 references. Web references in your paper should have the title of the site, the URL, and the date you referenced it. *Example*: Mitochondria: architecture dictates function, http://cellbio.utmb.edu/ cellbio/mitoch1.htm, June 27, 2001	
	How do we document that the paper represents joint work?	The paper must be signed by all members of the group, stating, "We have read the entire paper and had an opportunity to make editing suggestions for all parts."	
Evals	When are my team member evaluations due?	You *MUST TURN IN* your team member evaluations together with your paper at the beginning of class on August 8. If these evals are not included, your team paper will lose 5 points for each day any evaluation is missing.	
Log	What do we do with our project log?	You *MUST TURN IN* your project log, along with your paper. The log should be a detailed journal of all the team activities—I should be able to tell exactly what went on, who was late, who left early, etc.	
Presentation	How long do we have for our presentation?	20 minutes. You will have a warning at 18 minutes, then have 2 minutes to finish up. After 20 minutes, you will have to stop talking. After the talk, you will have 5 minutes for questions.	
	How can I have my handouts copied?	You can make 35 copies of your handouts to bring with you on Wednesday. Alternately, we will make copies for you IF YOU BRING THE ORIGINALS BY 5:00 on TUESDAY, August 7, 2001, to Wendy Rockhill in 248 Kincaid Hall (616-3383).	

	Question	Answer	Check
Presentation	What are we doing about PowerPoint presentations?	You are safest to stick with fonts such as Times, Arial (Geneva), or Symbol. If you use an unusual font, please embed the font in your presentation. You can do this by using the "Save as" function and checking "Embed font." Getting to the ™Embed font∫ command varies depending on the version of PowerPoint you are using. If you are using PowerPoint, you must bring your presentation by 5:00, TUESDAY, August 7 to Robin Wright in 238 Kincaid Hall (685-3651). You can bring it on a floppy, CD, or Zip disk. NOTE: For Mac users, please use a PC-formatted floppy or Zip. You can also ftp it, if you know the ftp address you need to access, but again, you have to come to my office so we can get it onto my computer ahead of time and make sure it is functioning. To judge length of talk, estimate about one slide per minute.	
	How can I practice my talk?	Tentative: Kincaid Hall room 114 has been reserved for all day on Tuesday, August 7 (about 8:00 until 5:00). To use the room, come see Robin in 238 Kincaid. She will have a data projector and computer that you can use for practice.	
Recap	Tuesday, August 7	Get your PowerPoint presentation to Robin so she can load on her computer. Bring your handouts to Wendy so she can make copies for you. Double-check with Wendy or Robin to make sure that you have everything you need for your presentation.	
	Wednesday, August 8	1. Turn in the paper, signed by all group members. 2. Turn in the paper on a floppy or CD or Zip. 3. Turn in the individual team member evaluations. 4. Turn in the project log. 5. Give your presentation (20 minutes + 5 minutes for questions).	
	Thursday, August 9	Finish presentations. Pick up your research paper and begin plans for next presentation.	