## Supplemental Material

CBE—Life Sciences Education
Roche Allred et al.

## Supporting Material

# "Big Ideas" of the Introductory Chemistry and Biology Courses and the Connections 

## Between Them

Zahilyn D. Roche Allred ${ }^{1}$, Laura Santiago Caobi ${ }^{1}$, Brittney Pardinas ${ }^{1}$, Andrea Echarri-Gonzalez ${ }^{1}$, Kathryn P. Kohn ${ }^{2}$, Alex T. Kararo ${ }^{1}$, Melanie M. Cooper ${ }^{2}$, Sonia M. Underwood ${ }^{1 *}$
${ }^{1}$ Department of Chemistry \& Biochemistry and STEM Transformation Institute, Florida International University, Miami, Florida 33199, United States
${ }^{2}$ Department of Chemistry, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824, United States

The following document includes:
S. 1 Demographic Information
S. 2 Survey Summary
S. 3 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews
S. 4 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews
S. 5 List "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Codebook and Counts from the Survey
S. 6 List "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Codebook and Counts from the Survey
S. 7 Comparing the Lists of "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Counts from the Interview and Survey
S. 8 Comparing the Lists of "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Counts from the Interview and Survey
S. 9 Summary of the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas from the Chemistry \& Biology Courses
S. 10 Reasoning Codebook from the Interviews
S. 11 Reasoning - Counts from the Interviews
S. 12 List of Overlapping Ideas: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews
S. 13 List of Overlapping Ideas: Codebook and Counts from the Survey

## S. 1 Demographic Information

Table S.1A Students who participated in the interviews

| Students | Spring ${ }^{\prime} 14$ $(N=14)$ | Spring ' ${ }^{15}$ $(N=14)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gender | $\begin{gathered} n=6 \text { Females } \\ n=8 \text { Males } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & n=9 \text { Females } \\ & n=5 \text { Males } \end{aligned}$ |
| Course GPAs | GC 1 | GC 1 |
|  | Mean: 3.73 <br> Median: 4.00 <br> Minimum: 2.50 <br> Maximum: 4.00 | Mean:3.82 <br> Median: 4.00 <br> Minimum:3.00 <br> Maximum:4.00 |
|  | GC 2 | GC 2 |
|  | Mean: 3.23 <br> Median: 3.50 <br> Minimum: 2.00 <br> Maximum: 4.00 | Mean: 3.54 <br> Median:3.50 <br> Minimum:2.00 <br> Maximum:4.00 |
|  | B1 | B1 |
|  | Mean:3.38 <br> Median: 4.00 <br> Minimum:1.50 <br> Maximum:4.00 | Mean:3.42 <br> Median: 3.47 <br> Minimum: 2.00 <br> Maximum: 4.00 |

Table S.1B Students who participated in the survey

| Students | Registered in GC2 <br> $(\mathbf{N}=\mathbf{8 1 5})$ | Completed Survey <br> $(\mathbf{N}=\mathbf{1 0 9})$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gender | $n=457$ Females | $n=70$ Females |
|  | $n=358$ Males | $n=39$ Males |
| Performance: | Mean: $2.99^{* *}$ | Mean: $3.17^{* *}$ |
|  | Median: 3.50 | Median: 3.00 |
|  | S.D.: 1.17 | S.D.: 1.01 |
|  | Minimum: 0.00 | Minimum: 0.00 |
|  | Maximum: 4.00 | Maximum: 4.00 |

[^0]
## S. 2 Survey Summary

## Questions:

1. HS Science Courses
2. General Chemistry
a. Please provide a description of what you learned in your college general chemistry 1 lecture course.
b. Do you feel that taking general chemistry 1 in college was a worthwhile experience? Please describe why or why not.
3. Other Course (Repeated for Biology, Physics and Other Science Courses as selected by the students) [Below questions are referring to the biology courses due to the nature of the paper]
a. Please provide a description of what you learned in your college cell and molecular biology lecture course.
b. Do you feel that taking cell and molecular biology in college was a worthwhile experience? Please describe why or why not.
4. Relationship Questions
a. Please describe the ways in which you see the concepts in your college general chemistry 1 and cell and molecular biology courses as being connected.
b. Do you think you benefited from taking you college general chemistry 1 and cell and molecular biology courses at the same time? Please describe why or why not.
c. Please describe any ideas or topics that you covered in your general chemistry 1 course that you found useful for thinking about cell and molecular biology.
i. Why do you think these ideas or topics were useful?
d. Please describe any ideas or topics that you covered in your cell and molecular biology course that you found useful for thinking about general chemistry 1 .
i. Why do you think these ideas or topics were useful?
e. Many colleges require that students take some chemistry as a prerequisite for biology. Why do you think this is the case?
f. In your opinion, should some chemistry be a pre-requirement, co-requirement, or not required prior to taking biology? Please explain.

## S. 3 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews

As a reminder A represents "Things" Learned in the Course, B represents Big Ideas Listed or Stated, and C represents "Both: "Things" Learned in the Course \& Big Ideas Listed and Stated.

| Things Learned \& Big Ideas | Descriptions* | A |  | C |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| *To stay true to students' ideas, their language was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always |  |  |  |  |  |
| Interactions | Student talks about intermolecular forces, interactions, or attractions. Student may or may not provide one or more examples of intermolecular forces such as Dipole-dipole, London dispersions, hydrogen bonding. | 9 | 1 | 12 | 22 |
| Reactions | Student provides a general description of reactions. Student may or may not provide examples of reactions such as Acid-Base Reactions, Redox Reactions, etc. | 8 | 4 | 8 | 20 |
| Type of bonds | Student talks about bonds/bonding or types of bonds as a chemistry idea. As examples the student may or may not list different types of bonding such as covalent, ionic, metallic bonding, pi bonding, sigma bonding. | 9 | 1 | 5 | 15 |
| Structures | Student describes drawing structures of molecules or having a symbol in the center and dots representing the number of valence electrons to determine the number of bonds the element can form. Student also may or may not refer to the characteristics that can be identified from a molecule by looking at a Lewis structure such as: polarity, bond angles, shape. | 7 | 0 | 7 | 14 |
| Acids and bases | Student simply talks about acids and bases without specifying types of acids or bases. The student may or may not mention $\mathrm{p} K_{\mathrm{a}}$ and $K_{\mathrm{a}}$ as part of their description of acids and bases. | 9 | 2 | 1 | 12 |
| Energy | Student talks about energy as a chemistry idea. The student may or may not talk about types of energy such as potential and kinetic energy and even potential energy curve. | 7 | 1 | 3 | 11 |


| Periodic trends | Student talks about trends associated to how elements are organized such as electronegativity, ionization energy, atomic radius, electron affinity, etc. | 6 | 0 | 5 | 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gibbs free energy | Student explicitly mentions Gibbs free energy or free energy. This does not include a student mentioning Gibbs free energy as a description or an example of what $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ thinks thermodynamics is. It does not include a student talking about how a reaction depends on entropy and enthalpy unless they are explicit about how these relate to Gibbs free energy. | 8 | 1 | 1 | 10 |
| Reaction equilibrium | Student refers to the K and Q of an equation and how the calculations resulting from that determined what needed to be added to restore equilibrium. Student may also state that it equals the rate of forward over the backwards rate of a reactions. | 6 | 1 | 3 | 10 |
| Reaction rate | Student talks about the rate of reactions. The student may talk about energy curves, reaction coordinate diagrams or activation energy to describe what $\mathrm{s} /$ he means by reaction rate. | 9 | 1 | 0 | 10 |
| Enthalpy | Student talks about changes in enthalpy of a reaction as a chemistry idea. Student could simply list or mention delta H as an idea. This does not include a student mentioning enthalpy as a description or an example of what $\mathrm{s} /$ he thinks thermodynamics is. | 7 | 2 | 0 | 9 |
| Entropy | Student talks about changes in entropy of a reaction as a chemistry idea. Student could simply list or mention delta S as an idea. This does not include a student mentioning enthalpy as a description or an example of what $\mathrm{s} /$ he thinks thermodynamics is. | 7 | 2 | 0 | 9 |


| pH | Student talks about pH calculations and may or may not talk about $\mathrm{p} k_{\mathrm{a}}$, $k_{\mathrm{a}}$ and different types of concentrations of ions found in solutions to aid in calculating pH . Student may also mention the existence of a pH scale. | 8 | 1 | 0 | 9 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Stoichiometry | Student talks about stoichiometry as an import idea in chemistry. As examples student may mention balancing equations, conversions from moles to grams or vice versa, and the use of Avogadro's number for equations. | 5 | 1 | 3 | 9 |
| Molarity | Student talks about the stoichiometry of a solution or the concentration of a solution as an important concept in chemistry. | 6 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| Atom | Student describes atoms as the entity that "everything is made of." The student could have also described the atom as the "building block" or "unit" of matter. | 4 | 1 | 0 | 5 |
| Atomic structure/theory | Student talks about the electronic structure of the atom and how in the center of the atom is made of protons and neutrons or nucleus. The student did not specify an atomic model and did not describe a specific atomic model. | 3 | 1 | 1 | 5 |
| Endothermic/ exothermic | Student talks about how reactions process that either absorb or release energy. | 3 | 0 | 2 | 5 |
| Thermodynamics | Student explicitly talks about thermodynamics, $\mathrm{s} /$ he can talk about heat, specific heat, temperature changes, entropy, enthalpy, heat capacity, systems, and surroundings as part of their descriptions or examples. This code does not include students that mentioned, entropy, enthalpy or Gibbs free energy. | 4 | 0 | 1 | 5 |


| Atomic models | Student talks about how the models of the electronic structure of the atom have evolved over time (History of the atomic models). Some students provided example of different models such as the Plum pudding model. | 3 | 0 | 1 | 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Molecular geometry | Student talks about 3D shapes, molecule shapes, etc. but does not explicitly mention any type of bonding or type of structure. Use this if the student does not mention any type of bonding theory. | 4 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| Periodic table | Student talks about how the elements are organized, what kind of information can be obtained from the periodic table and the type of elements (Atomic numbers, atomic weight, group names, family names). | 4 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| Bond strength | Student talks about the relative strength of bonds. A student might talk about factors that can affect the bond strength of a molecule, such as structure and polarity. | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| Hybridization | Student talks about the "mixing of atomic orbitals" and may or may not refer to this as hybridization of atomic orbitals. | 2 | 0 | 1 | 3 |
| Structure determines properties | Student describes how the structures of molecules determines the properties of molecules. | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| Bonding energy | Student specifically talks about the energy associated with bonds. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |


|  | Student talks about the <br> composition of buffers, as being <br> made of a weak acid and conjugate <br> base. Student may or may not refer <br> to the carbonic anhydrase system <br> in the blood as a type of buffer as <br> well as the equation needed to <br> calculate pH for buffers - <br> Henderson-Hasselback. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Electron orbital/ atomic | Student describes the region of <br> space where an electron is found as <br> an electron/atomic orbital or just <br> orbital. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Factors affecting | Student talks about "things" that <br> could affect reaction rates. Student <br> mentions temperature, pressure and <br> changes in concentrations. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Feaction rates |  |  |  |  |  |


| Don't Know | Students talked about how they <br> didn't know what the big ideas of <br> the course were. | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Algorithmic problem | Student refers to using the correct <br> formula to solve a problem. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Charged Molecule | Student talks about molecules <br> having or "holding" either a <br> positive or negative charge. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Chemical and physical <br> foundations of life | Student says that the big idea of <br> chemistry was to describe the <br> "chemical and physical <br> foundations of life" without <br> providing more details. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Chemical vs. physical <br> changes | Student talks about differences in <br> chemical and physical changes. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Electron configuration | Student mentions electron <br> configuration as a big idea of <br> chemistry. Student may or may not <br> talk about quantum numbers to talk <br> about electron configuration. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Enzyme | Student talks about how there are <br> proteins or enzymes that assist or <br> help speed up reactions in the cell. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Fquilibrium constant | Students mentions how reactions <br> have an equilibrium constant and <br> this value shows the point at which <br> the forward and backward reaction <br> rates are equal. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Ions | Student talks about how forces are <br> important to understand in the <br> course. | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Matter | Student describes charged <br> molecules or atoms as important <br> ideas in chemistry. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
|  | Student talks about how everything <br> is made out of matter. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
|  |  |  |  |  | 1 |


| Mixture and solutions | Student talks about how an <br> important concept in chemistry is <br> to be able to differentiate between <br> mixtures and solutions. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Nucleophiles and <br> electrophiles | Student talks about nucleophiles <br> and electrophiles in terms of their <br> reactivity/interactions with one <br> another. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Quantum model | Student talks about the quantum <br> theory and describes it in term of <br> wavelength, frequency and how it <br> relates to light particles. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Rate law | Student speaks about order of <br> reactions. The student may <br> mention the order of a reaction. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Rate order | Student talks about how the rate <br> orders of reactions are related to <br> how fast concentration of the <br> reactants change. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Solubility | Student talks about how "things" <br> dissolve. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Solutions | Student talks about solutions as an <br> important concept in chemistry. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Vype of systems | Student talks about closed and <br> open systems independently of <br> thermodynamics. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Valence electrons | Student talks about the outermost <br> electrons in the atom. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Wavelength | Student specifically mentions <br> VSEPR as an important chemistry <br> idea and describe the structure of a <br> molecule. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Student talks about learning about <br> wavelength. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | 1 |

S. 4 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews

| Things Learned \& Big Ideas | Descriptions* | A | B | C | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| *To stay true to students' ideas, their language was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always scientifically accurate. |  |  |  |  |  |
| DNA replication | Student describes how DNA is replicated in the cell. The student could talk about templates or DNA strands. | 16 | 1 | 5 | 22 |
| Cell respiration | Student could talk about glycolysis or the production of ATP; Energy cycles, suggesting that energy is neither created nor destroyed. Students spoke about other processes involved in cellular respiration such as citric acid cycle/Krebs cycle. | 9 | 1 | 7 | 17 |
| DNA | Students talks about the importance of DNA. Student could describe the composition of DNA, referring to its double helix and the nucleotides and different nitrogenous bases. | 10 | 4 | 2 | 16 |
| Macromolecules | Student talks about how there are different types of macromolecules or biomolecules, their different structures, and mentioned carbohydrates, lipids, nucleic acids, and proteins. | 11 | 0 | 4 | 15 |
| Photosynthesis | Student describes this process as how energy comes from the sun and it cycles in plants, suggesting that energy is neither created nor destroyed. | 11 | 0 | 4 | 15 |
| Cell organelles | Student talks about the different "parts" of the cells. The student could refer to these parts as organelles or even list some of these organelles. | 8 | 2 | 4 | 14 |
| Structure-Function Relationship | Student describes or talks about how the structures of molecules/organelle determines its function. | 1 | 8 | 2 | 11 |
| Translation | Students talks about how mRNA is decoded in the ribosome to "get" proteins from individual amino acids. | 7 | 3 | 1 | 11 |
| Cell division | Student either mentions cell division or mentions meiosis and/or mitosis. Student could also refer to this as cell reproduction. | 5 | 3 | 2 | 10 |
| Transcriptions | Student describes how RNA is synthesized | 7 | 2 | 1 | 10 |


|  | from the DNA. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mutation | Student talks about changes in genetic material and expression of proteins like Trisomy 21. Student may talk about mutations leading to the constant revision of vaccines and the production of cancer cells as a result of genetic changes. | 9 | 0 | 0 | 9 |
| Functional group | Student talks about different functional groups including Hydroxyl groups; phosphate groups, amino groups, methyl group, acetyl group. | 6 | 0 | 1 | 7 |
| Enzyme | Student talks about how there are proteins or enzymes that assist or help speed up reactions in the cell. | 6 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| Genes | Traits expressed, genetic instructions for organisms. Students used a variety of terms to talk about genes and how these led to different genetic traits. The example of Punnett Squares as a form to predict possible inherited traits was used. How genes are expressed and how different states such as methylation affect gene expression. | 4 | 1 | 1 | 6 |
| Cellular signaling | Student talks about how cells have "ways" or process by which they communicate within and outside of the cell. | 2 | 0 | 3 | 5 |
| Types of cells: Eukaryotic \& Prokaryotic | Student talks about how there are different type of cells such as animal and plant cells; differences between prokaryotic and eukaryotic cells. | 4 | 0 | 1 | 5 |
| Central dogma | Student is explicitly mentioning the Central dogma and describes it as the process by which DNA goes to RNA which goes to proteins. | 2 | 1 | 1 | 4 |
| Energy | Student talks about energy as a biology idea. The student may or may not talk about types of energy such as potential and kinetic energy and even potential energy curve. | 3 | 1 | 0 | 4 |
| Evolution | Student talks about the history of organisms and the different components that played a role into the development of organisms, such as mutations and environmental effects. Student could provide examples of phylogenies trees, the difference between eukaryotic and prokaryotic and animal versus | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 |


|  | plant cells, and tree thinking. |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ATP | Student talks about ATP as the "energy <br> source" in the cell. | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| Membranes | Student talks about cell membrane and some <br> properties of membranes such as their <br> permeability. |  |  |  |  |
| Polarity | Student talks about the polarity of molecules, <br> or the electronegativity associated with atoms <br> within a molecule. | 2 | 0 | 1 | 3 |
| RNA | Single stranded genetic code used to "create <br> proteins." Student did not say transcription or <br> translation. | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| Types of cells: | Student talks about how there are different <br> type of cells such as animal and plant cells; <br> differences between prokaryotic and <br> eukaryotic cells. |  |  |  |  |
| Animal \& Plants |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | list some of these organelles. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Glycolysis | Student specifically mentions glycolysis without referring to the cell respiration process. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Hydrophobicity | Student talks about the level of hydrophobicity of molecules as an example the student may talk about the distinct characteristic of the phospholipid bilayer with polar heads and nonpolar tails. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Interactions | Student talks about intermolecular forces, interactions or attractions. Student may or may not provide one or more examples of intermolecular forces such as Dipole-dipole, London dispersions, hydrogen bonding. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Properties of water | Student talks about the importance of water, and some properties associate to water. | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| Thermodynamics | Student explicitly talks about thermodynamics, s/he can talk about heat, specific heat, temperature changes, entropy, enthalpy, heat capacity, systems, and surroundings as part of their descriptions or examples. This code does not include students that simply mentioned, entropy, enthalpy or Gibbs free energy. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Types of bonds | Student talks about bonds/bonding or types of bonds as a chemistry idea. As examples the student may or may not list different types of bonding such as covalent, ionic, metallic bonding, pi bonding, sigma bonding. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Virus | Student talks about the development of different viruses has given rise to the creation and the research of vaccines. Student could talk about different viruses like HIV, and flu. | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| Atomic theory | Student talks about the electronic structure of the atom and how in the center of the atom is made of protons and neutrons or nucleus. The student did not specify an atomic model and did not describe a specific atomic model. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Cancer | Student talks about how cancer cells grow and metabolize in the body. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Data interpretation | Students speaks about learning the skill of understanding data sets to answer questions in class. | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |


| Drug | Student mentions learning about how drugs <br> affect cellular processes. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Electron transport | Student simply mentions that s/he learned <br> about electron transport. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Fluid mosaic <br> model | Student talks about the proteins and other <br> biomolecules embedded on the cell <br> membrane. |  |  |  |  |
| Gene regulation | Student talks about how genes are regulated in <br> the cells. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Hydrolysis | Student simply mentions learning about <br> hydrolysis in the course. | 0 | 0 | 1 |  |
| Living systems | Student talks about living systems as being <br> important for biology. | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Matter | Student talks about how everything is made <br> out of matter. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Operon | Student talks about operons and their <br> functions. As an example, the student talks <br> about prokaryotic operons. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Phylogenies | Student talks about the diagram of a <br> phylogenetic tree-diagram used to show <br> differences in genetic traits. |  | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Proteins | Student talks about structures and different <br> structural features of proteins. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Signaling cascades | Student talks about signaling cascades that <br> happen in the body, such as hormones. | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |

S. 5 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Codebook and Counts from the Survey

| "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas | Descriptions* | GC1 | GC2 | Both | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| *To stay true to students ' ideas, their language was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always scientifically accurate |  |  |  |  |  |
| Reactions | Student provides a general description of reactions. Student may or may not provide examples of reactions such as Acid-Base Reactions, Redox Reactions, Coupled Reactions, etc. Student may also mention heat and work transfer during reactions. | 10 | 39 | 15 | 64 |
| Interactions | Student talks about intermolecular forces, interactions, or attractions. Student may or may not provide one or more examples of intermolecular forces such as Dipoledipole, London dispersions, hydrogen bonding. | 44 | 2 | 10 | 56 |
| Reaction Rate | Student talks about the rate of reactions. The student may talk about reaction rate in terms of how fast and far a reaction will go. | 2 | 27 | 2 | 31 |
| Acids \& Bases | Student talks about acids and bases. Student may or may not mention how acids and bases interact/react with each other. | 4 | 26 | 0 | 30 |
| Atoms | Student describes atoms as the entity that "everything is made of." The student could have also mentioned atomic models. | 24 | 0 | 0 | 24 |
| Thermodynamics | Student explicitly talks about thermodynamics, $\mathrm{s} /$ he can talk about systems as part of their descriptions or examples. This code does not include students that mentioned, entropy, enthalpy or Gibbs free energy. | 7 | 10 | 3 | 20 |
| pH | Student talks about pH calculations and may or may not talk about $\mathrm{pKa}, \mathrm{Ka}$ and different types of concentrations of ions found in solutions to aid in calculating pH . | 1 | 16 | 2 | 19 |
| Structures | Student talks about atomic, molecular, and chemical structure. This code does not include Lewis structures. | 17 | 1 | 1 | 19 |


| No Specific Idea(s) Provided | Student did not provide a topic. | 7 | 8 | 2 | 17 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Molecules | Students talks about molecules. Some mention how molecules are formed. | 15 | 0 | 0 | 15 |
| Reaction <br> Equilibrium | Student refers to the K of an equation and some students may provide examples of equilibrium such as dynamic equilibrium. | 4 | 11 | 1 | 16 |
| Types of bonds | Student talks about bonds/bonding or types of bonds as a chemistry idea. Students may mention the breaking and forming of bonds. This code does not include the energy associated with bonds. | 11 | 1 | 2 | 14 |
| Entropy | Student explicitly mentions entropy. | 4 | 8 | 1 | 13 |
| Energy | Student talks about energy as a chemistry idea. The student may or may not talk about types of energy such as potential and kinetic, energy changes, transfer of energy, and where energy goes in a system. Student may also mention how the transfer of energy is due to collisions. | 6 | 0 | 4 | 10 |
| Element | Student talks about elements as a basic idea in chemistry. | 9 | 0 | 0 | 9 |
| Enthalpy | Student explicitly mentions enthalpy. | 2 | 6 | 1 | 9 |
| Gibbs Free Energy | Student explicitly mentions Gibbs free energy. | 2 | 5 | 1 | 9 |
| Buffer | Student talks about buffers. Student may also mention how acids and bases can act as buffers. | 1 | 7 | 0 | 8 |
| Stoichiometry | Student talks about stoichiometry. Student may also mention how stoichiometry is used to convert between grams and moles. | 6 | 2 | 0 | 8 |
| Periodic trends | Student talks about periodic trends. | 5 | 1 | 0 | 6 |
| Periodic table | Student talks about the periodic table. Students may mention that they learned how to interpret the periodic table. | 5 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| Reaction <br> Mechanisms | Student talks about reaction mechanisms. | 0 | 5 | 0 | 5 |


| Solutions | Student talks about solutions. Student may <br> mention acids and bases as examples of <br> solutions and may also mention the way <br> solutions interact. | 0 | 5 | 0 | 5 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Activation <br> Energy | Student talks about activation energy. | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| Concentration | Students talk about the concentration of a <br> solution. | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 |
| Ions | Student talks about ions. | 3 | 0 | 0 | 3 |
| Rate Laws | Student talks about rate equations | 0 | 2 | 1 | 3 |
| Bonding Energy | Student specifically talks about the energy <br> associated with bonds. Student may <br> mention bond breaking and forming in <br> relation to energy. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Catalysts | Student talks about catalysts | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| Hybridization | Students mention hybridization without <br> providing any more details. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Kinetics | Student talks about kinetics of reactions. | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| Subatomic <br> Particles | Students talk about protons, neutrons, <br> electrons. This code does not include <br> valence electrons. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Spectra | Student talks about spectra. Student may <br> mention examples such as the <br> electromagnetic spectrum and <br> spectroscopy. | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Student talks about closed systems <br> independently of thermodynamics. | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 |  |
| Types of <br> Systems | Student mentioned that chemistry relates to | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
|  <br> physical <br> foundation of life | life without providing any more details. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Collisions | Student talks about collisions. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Enzymes | Student talks about enzymes. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Half Life | Student talks about half life. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Light | Student talks about light as a particle and <br> wave. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Student talks about limiting reactant <br> Rroblems. | 1 | 0 | 2 |  |  |


| Matter | Student talks about states of matter. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Melting point | Student talks about melting point. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Oxidation <br> Numbers | Student talks about oxidation numbers. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Particle-wave <br> theory | Student talks about learning about particle <br> wave theory. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Phase changes | Student talks about phase changes and <br> properties of phase changes. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Photon | Student talks about learning about photons. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Physical <br> properties | Student talks about physical properties as <br> being a result of interactions between <br> atoms, molecules, and ions. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Reactants | Student talks about reactants. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Compound | Student talks about compounds. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Reaction <br> Diagram | Student talks about reaction diagrams. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Regulation | Student talks about regulation. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Structure <br> determines <br> Property | Student describes how the structures of <br> molecules determines the properties of <br> molecules. | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Universe | Student talks about fundamentals of the <br> universe. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Valence <br> electrons | Student talks about the outermost electrons <br> in the atom. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Waves | Student talks about learning about waves. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Weight | Student mentioned how weight is <br> determined when reactions are taking <br> place. | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |

S. 6 List for the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Codebook and Counts from the Survey

| "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas | Descriptions* | No. of Students |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| *To stay true to students' deas, the | nguage was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always scie | trifically accurate |
| Cells/Cell Structure | Student mentions studying the cell or its structure as a whole. For example, how cells functions. | 54 |
| Cellular Respiration | Student talks about cellular respiration. Student may or may not have mentioned parts of cellular respiration such as glycolysis, Krebs's cycle, and electron transport chain. | 25 |
| Photosynthesis | Student talks about photosynthesis. | 25 |
| Genes | Student talks about genes. Student may or may not talk about gene expression and inheritance. | 22 |
| Transcription/Translation | Student explicitly mentions transcription and translation | 19 |
| Cell Cycle | Student talks about cell cycle. May refer to the cell cycle as cell replication. | 18 |
| DNA Replication | Student talks about DNA replication. Student may also refer to DNA replication as "copying DNA" | 17 |
| DNA | Student talks about DNA. Student may or may not also mention their structures. | 14 |
| RNA | Student talks about RNA. Student may or may not also mention their structures. | 14 |
| Cell Division | Student talks about cell division. May refer to the cell division in terms of mitosis and meiosis. | 13 |
| Macromolecules | Student talks about how there are different types of macromolecules and mentioned carbohydrates, lipids, nucleic acids, and proteins. | 10 |
| Molecules | Student talks about molecules. Student may mention how molecules are created and talk about molecules as having a function in the cell. | 10 |
| Human Body | Student talks about the human body. Student may or may not mention the processes of the human body, the systems in the human body, etc. | 10 |
| Cell Signaling | Student talks about cell signaling. Student may refer to cell signaling as cell communication. | 9 |
| Proteins/Protein Structure | Student talks about proteins. Student may or may not mention protein structure, how proteins are made, and even RNA translation to describe what they mean by how proteins are made. | 9 |


| No Specific Topic Provided | Student did not provide a specific topic learned. | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Genetics | Student talks about genetics. Student may mention RNA's role in genetics. | 6 |
| Structure-Function | Student talks about structure-function relationships. Student may mention structure-function of cells, macromolecules, proteins, etc. and talk about how these maintain an organism. | 6 |
| Structure | Student talks about structure. Student may or may not provide examples of structure such as structure of plant, animal, and bacterial cells, macromolecules, atoms, molecules, etc. | 5 |
| Types of Cells: <br> Eukaryotes/Prokaryotes | Student talks about prokaryotes and eukaryotes. Student may or may not also mention their structures, mechanisms, and how these cells compare and differ. | 5 |
| Interactions | Student talks about interactions between cells, molecules, and atoms. | 4 |
| Amino Acids | Student talks about amino acids. | 3 |
| Cell Organelles | Student talks about cell organelles. | 3 |
| Cellular Processes | Student talks about cellular processes. This can also be referred to as function of organelles. | 3 |
| Organisms | Student talks about organisms. Student may or may not also talk about organisms at the cellular level and how cells affect organisms. | 3 |
| Central Dogma | Student talks about the central dogma. Student may or may not also talk about the central dogma as "how DNA is made into proteins". This code does not include transcription and translation. | 2 |
| Cancer/Diseases | Student talks about cancer and disease biology. | 2 |
| Membranes | Student talks about the cell membrane. | 2 |
| Metabolism | Student talks about metabolism. Student may or may not refer to metabolism as a life process. | 2 |
| Mutations | Student talks about mutations. | 2 |
| Reactions | Student may talk about the reactions that take place within cells or the human body. | 2 |
| ATP | Student talks about ATP production. | 1 |
| Biological Systems | Student talks about biological systems. | 1 |
| Calvin Cycle | Student talks about the Calvin Cycle. | 1 |


| Energy | Student talks about processes that convert water air and <br> energy to glucose and back. | 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Organic Compounds | Student talks about organic compounds. | 1 |
| Phenotype | Student talks about phenotype. | 1 |
|  | Student talks about how the most important thing they <br> learned in cell and molecular biology was how to make a <br> model of a scientific process. | 1 |
| Scientific Model | Student talks about temperature. | 1 |
| Temperature | Student talks about thermodynamics. | 1 |
| Thermodynamics | Student talks about virus. | 1 |
| Virus |  |  |

## S. 7 Comparing the Lists of "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Chemistry: Counts from the Interview and Survey

| "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas | Interview Data (No. of Students | Survey Data (No. of Students) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Acids \& Bases | 12 | 30 |
| Activation Energy | 0 | 3 |
| Algorithmic problem | 1 | 0 |
| Atom | 5 | 24 |
| Atomic models | 4 | 0 |
| Atomic structure/theory | 5 | 0 |
| Bond strength | 3 | 0 |
| Bonding energy | 2 | 2 |
| Buffer | 2 | 8 |
| Catalysts | 0 | 2 |
| Charged Molecule | 1 | 0 |
| Chemical \& physical foundation of life | 1 | 1 |
| Chemical vs. Physical changes | 1 | 0 |
| Collisions | 0 | 1 |
| Compound | 0 | 1 |
| Concentration | 0 | 3 |
| Electron configuration | 1 | 0 |
| Electron orbital/ Atomic orbital | 2 | 0 |
| Element | 0 | 9 |
| Endergonic/Exergonic | 0 | 1 |
| Endothermic/ Exothermic | 5 | 0 |
| Energy | 11 | 10 |
| Enthalpy | 9 | 9 |
| Entropy | 9 | 13 |
| Enzyme | 1 | 0 |
| Equilibrium | 10 | 16 |
| Equilibrium constant | 1 | 0 |
| Exothermic/Endothermic Process | 0 | 1 |
| Factors affecting reactions | 2 | 0 |
| Forces | 1 | 0 |
| Formal charges | 2 | 0 |
| Gibbs Free Energy | 10 | 9 |


| Half Life | 0 | 1 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Hybridization | 3 | 2 |
| Interactions | 22 | 56 |
| Ions | 1 | 3 |
| Kinetics | 0 | 2 |
| Light | 0 | 1 |
| Light particle | 2 | 0 |
| Limiting Reactant | 0 | 1 |
| Matter | 1 | 1 |
| Melting point | 0 | 1 |
| Mixture and solutions | 1 | 0 |
| Molarity | 6 | 0 |
| Molecular geometry | 4 | 0 |
| Molecular orbital | 2 | 0 |
| Molecules | 0 | 15 |
| No topic Provided | 2 | 17 |
| Nucleophiles and electrophiles | 1 | 0 |
| Origins of the Universe | 2 | 0 |
| Oxidation Numbers | 0 | 1 |
| Particle-wave theory | 0 | 1 |
| Periodic table | 4 | 5 |
| Periodic trends | 11 | 6 |
| pH | 9 | 19 |
| Phase changes | 0 | 1 |
| Photon | 0 | 1 |
| Physical properties | 0 | 1 |
| Polarity | 2 | 0 |
| Pressure | 0 | 1 |
| Properties of water | 2 | 0 |
| Quantum model | 1 | 0 |
| Rate Laws | 1 | 3 |
| Rate order | 1 | 0 |
| Reactants | 0 | 1 |
| Reaction Diagram | 0 | 1 |
| Reaction Mechanisms | 0 | 5 |
| Reaction Rate | 10 | 31 |
| Reactions | 20 | 64 |


| Regulation | 0 | 1 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Solubility | 1 | 0 |
| Solutions | 1 | 5 |
| Spectra | 0 | 2 |
| Stoichiometry | 9 | 8 |
| Structure determines properties | 3 | 1 |
| Structures | 14 | 19 |
| Subatomic particles | 0 | 2 |
| Thermodynamics | 5 | 20 |
| Type of bonds | 15 | 14 |
| Type of systems | 1 | 2 |
| Universe | 0 | 1 |
| Valence electrons | 1 | 1 |
| Valence/Outer orbitals | 2 | 0 |
| VSEPR | 1 | 0 |
| Wavelength | 1 | 0 |
| Waves | 0 | 1 |
| Weight | 0 | 1 |

## S. 8 Comparing the Lists of "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas in Biology: Counts from the Interview and Survey

| "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas | Interview Data <br> (No. of Students | Survey Data <br> (No. of Students) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Amino Acids | 0 | 3 |
| Atomic theory | 1 | 0 |
| Atoms | 2 | 0 |
| ATP | 3 | 1 |
| Biological Systems | 0 | 1 |
| Calvin Cycle | 2 | 1 |
| Cancer/Diseases | 1 | 2 |
| Cell cycle | 2 | 19 |
| Cell division | 10 | 13 |
| Cell organelles | 14 | 3 |
| Cell signaling | 0 | 11 |
| Cells/Cell Structure | 2 | 54 |
| Cellular processes | 2 | 3 |
| Cellular/Cell respiration | 17 | 26 |
| Central dogma | 4 | 3 |
| Chemical and Physical foundations of Life | 2 | 0 |
| Data interpretation | 1 | 0 |
| DNA | 16 | 16 |
| DNA replication | 22 | 19 |
| Drug | 1 | 0 |
| Electron transport | 1 | 0 |
| Energy | 4 | 1 |
| Enzyme | 6 | 0 |
| Evolution | 4 | 0 |
| Exothermic/Endothermic | 0 | 0 |
| Fermentation | 2 | 0 |
| Fluid mosaic model | 1 | 0 |
| Function of cell organelle | 2 | 0 |
| Functional group | 7 | 0 |
| Gene regulation | 2 | 0 |
| Genes | 2 | 0 |
| Genetics | 2 | 0 |
| Glycolysis | 2 | 0 |
|  | 2 | 0 |
|  | 2 | 0 |


| Human Body | 0 | 10 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Hydrolysis | 1 | 0 |
| Hydrophobicity | 2 | 0 |
| Interactions | 2 | 4 |
| Living systems | 1 | 0 |
| Macromolecules | 15 | 13 |
| Matter | 1 | 0 |
| Membranes | 3 | 2 |
| Metabolism | 0 | 2 |
| Molecules | 0 | 10 |
| Mutation | 9 | 2 |
| No Topic Provided | 0 | 7 |
| Operon | 1 | 0 |
| Organic compounds | 0 | 1 |
| Organisms | 0 | 3 |
| Phenotype | 0 | 1 |
| Photosynthesis | 15 | 25 |
| Phylogenies | 1 | 0 |
| Polarity | 3 | 0 |
| Properties of water | 2 | 0 |
| Proteins/ Protein Structures | 0 | 9 |
| Reactions | 0 | 2 |
| RNA | 3 | 16 |
| Scientific Model | 0 | 1 |
| Signaling cascades | 1 | 0 |
| Structure | 0 | 5 |
| Structure-Functions | 11 | 6 |
| Temperature | 0 | 1 |
| Thermodynamics | 2 | 1 |
| Transcription | 10 | 20 |
| Translation | 11 | 20 |
| Types of bonds | 2 | 0 |
| Types of cells: Animal \& Plants | 3 | 0 |
| Types of cells: Eukaryotic \& Prokaryotic | 5 | 5 |
| Virus | 2 | 1 |

## S. 9 Summary of the "Things" Learned \& Big Ideas from the Chemistry \& Biology Courses

The interview data revealed a total of 57 unique ideas listed or mentioned by students for the combination of the "things" learned and big ideas lists for the GC1/GC2 course with an average of six to seven "things" learned (A) in their GC1/GC2 course with one or two big ideas (B) or both (C) per student (see Table S.9). The students in B1 course listed a total of 53 unique ideas in the interviews where each student listed on average 5 or 6 topics or ideas as part of the "things" learned list from B1 and only one or two big ideas (Table S.9). The survey data produced a similar size list of unique ideas for students' chemistry courses ( 56 topics/ideas) and a lesser amount for their biology course ( 40 topics/ideas). This difference may stem from students in the survey being less specific with their ideas. For example, in both the interviews and surveys students listed ideas related to cells. In the interviews students tended to be more specific by talking about individual organelles, while in the survey students were broader and simply listed the cell as a "thing" learned in the course. The differences in the lists' sizes, broadness and specificity of unique ideas were also observed for chemistry. For example, in Figure 3 (in Main Text) with Galen's list, he included entropy and enthalpy separately while another student might consider them under the larger idea of thermodynamics. Therefore, it was important to further explore how students were thinking about their ideas mentioned.

Table S.9: Interview and Survey Data

| Interview Data (No. of <br> Topics/Ideas) | Average | Range | Survey Data (No. of <br> Topics/Ideas) | Average | Range |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Chemistry Ideas (GC1/GC2) |  | Chemistry Ideas <br> (GC1/GC2) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Topics/Ideas learned (A) | $6-7$ | $1-16$ | Topics/Ideas learned | $4-5$ | $0-13$ |  |  |
| Big ideas (B) | $1-2$ | $0-5$ | - | - | - |  |  |
| Both (C) | $1-2$ | $0-5$ | - | - | - |  |  |
| Biology Ideas (B1) |  |  | Biology Ideas (B1) |  |  |  |  |
| Topics/Ideas learned (A) | $5-6$ | $0-14$ | Topics/Ideas learned | $2-3$ | $0-8$ |  |  |
| Big ideas (B) | $1-2$ | $0-8$ | - | - | - |  |  |
| Both (C) | $1-2$ | $0-7$ | - | - | - |  |  |
| Overlapping Ideas | $2-3$ | $1-8$ | Overlapping Ideas |  |  |  |  |
|  | - | - | GC1/GC2 to B1 | $1-2$ | $0-8$ |  |  |
|  | - | - | B1 to GC1/GC2 | $1-2$ | $0-5$ |  |  |

Figures S.9A \& S.9B show the results from the students' lists created during the interviews when asked to identify the "things" and big ideas learned for their GC1/GC2 and B1 respectively. Both figures show ideas listed or stated by $25 \%$ or more of the students interviewed.


Figure S.9A: "Things" learned and big ideas listed or stated by $25 \%$ or more of the students for their GC1/GC2 course during the interview.

When compared to survey results, similar "things" learned and big ideas were observed. On both the interview and the survey, students identified reactions (in survey $59 \%, \mathrm{n}=64$ ) and interactions (in survey $51 \%, \mathrm{n}=56$ ) as the two most important key ideas. While similar "things" and ideas are observed on what students perceived to be important in their chemistry course such as acids $\&$ bases (in survey $28 \%, \mathrm{n}=30$ ), pH (in survey $17 \%, \mathrm{n}=19$ ), and types of bonds (in survey $13 \%, \mathrm{n}=14$ ), the percentage of students mentioning these individual ideas differed between the interview and the survey (see S. 3 and S.5). Even though in the survey students could move at their own pace to reflect on what they had learned in each course, the probing questions during the interviews most likely pushed students to be more reflective on what they considered to be important in the course. Overall, it can be
observed that the surveyed students wrote a broader list of "things" and ideas with some overlap between the two (see full lists in S.3-S.8).


Figure S.9B: "Things" learned and big ideas listed or stated by $25 \%$ or more of the students for their B1 course during the interview.

When comparing the interview and survey results, it can be observed that both sets of students considered the idea of cell/cellular respiration (Interview $61 \% n=17$, Survey $43 \% n=26$ ) to be important for the B1 course. However, major differences were observed among the ideas students considered to be important for the B1 course. While a very small number of the students interviewed talked about cell/cell structure $(7 \%, \mathrm{n}=2)$ as an important idea in the course, this idea was listed by the surveyed students the most $(47 \%, \mathrm{n}=54)$. Another difference is between the percent of students who considered structure-function to be a big idea in the course, while this was the most common big idea among the ideas listed during the interview, only $5 \%(n=6)$ of the surveyed students listed this as an "thing" learned in their B1 course. Despite these differences observed between the interview and survey data, there were also some overlaps on what students considered to be important for the course such as the topics of photosynthesis, DNA replication, and genes.

| Codes Chemistry | Description | Examples |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Time Spent on idea(s) | Student mentions having spent a lot of time, most of the time or a large amount of time of the course or the semester talking/using these topics/ideas/concepts. | "Just because I feel that we talked about it the whole first semester." - Galen |
| Re-occurring idea(s) | Student talks about how these concepts/ideas/topics "kept" coming back to everything they do (homework, activities, exams). | "The properties of water and bonds thing because it comes up in-it's repetitive, it comes up in a lot of my classes." - Aaron |
| Encompasses a large amount of ideas ("umbrella") | Student talks about how these concepts/ideas/topics helped them understand a lot of "smaller" ideas that were "under" these concepts/ideas/topics. | "Like I said I think everything is built upon those so if you understand that, you understand a bunch of the little concepts in the class. So if you were to take home one big idea it would be to understand those and know what goes on in them." - Joseph |
| Basis of the subject | Student talks about how these concepts/ideas/topics are the basis/building blocks/or is related to everything $\mathrm{s} /$ he learned in the course. This could also be described as the "key organizing principles" of the subject in the language of the Framework (National Research Council, 2012b). | "Because they're like the building blocks for everything else, I guess because they're like - I lost my train of thought. (pause) They make that substance, or atom-so if it's small and it's electronegative and then that's going to affect how it's going to react with a different atom that's big and polar-if that makes sense?" - Priyah |
| Personal experience | Student says these concepts/ideas/topics are big ideas because these are connected to the students' life and experiences. | "Probably because I never really had experience in understanding periodic trends. So that was one of the highlights of the course for me because now I really understand them." - Zoe |


| Need to know/understand/learn | Student talks about how these topics/concepts/ ideas/skill needed to be understood or know how to do it in order to move on with the subject; Student could talk about it as this is what the instructor had tried to "drill down" into the student's head. | "It's a lot of what we've been focusing on. I don't know. It seems like what he's/she's trying to drill into our heads, is like more of what we really need to know to move on." Clarice |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Remembered the most | Student mentions that these are topics/concepts/idea that $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ considered as big because that's what $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ remembered the most from the course. | "That's like what I remember most, but that could also be affected by what we've been learning this semester as opposed to like...I don't know. I probably could have given different answers if I thought about it way more, but my mind just doesn't seem to be working." - Tamara |
| Progression of ideas | Student talks about the big ideas as the concepts/topics/ideas that help her/him to start with a "small" idea and progress to more complex ideas/concepts | "You progress through them [big ideas]. First, [the instructor] taught us - I think he/she spent a good third of the first semester in [general chemistry 1] teaching us about atomic theory because it is just really important to learn about. And then he/she went to stoichiometry and then electron orbitals. And then I think electron orbitals and geometry kind of overlapped but I learned mostly about geometry in [general biology 1]." - Felix |
| Explanatory and predictive power | Student talks about how these ideas/concepts/topics help them explain the how and why, and/or make a prediction/guess other concepts/phenomena in the course | "Because these things all have got to come together to interact in a certain way to produce - like interact with the solution of water or with water in solution to make like acid and its conjugate base or base and it's conjugate acid and things like that. Like everything. Like if I didn't know about these interactions, it would be a lot harder for me to understand why atoms are getting rearranged in the ways they are. I guess that would be the |


|  |  | biggest help from like [instructor's name] style of teaching, just because I guess I could just straight up memorize - sure this atom is going to switch off with this atom. The beryllium's going to fly off and the sodium's going to jump on there and something like that. But if I can think about what properties do these atoms have like where they sit on the periodic table or what type of electronegativity or effective nuclear charge they have and things like that, you can predict stuff a little bit better in what your course is. I should think it's your general goal in the end. I guess." - Karl |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Memorized Facts | Student says that these concepts/topics/ideas are big because these are what she had done in the class and most of the class was very factual and consisted of memorization | "Because those are the main things that we've done I guess. Yeah, I don't know, I feel like it's a little bit different of an approach than chemistry. I feel like chemistry is very conceptual, and then Bio is more just like factual. I mean chemistry is too, but like the approaches of how they've been taught. Like I feel like chemistry is more like why does this happen, why does this happen? Whereas in Bio I feel like it's just like once you get to this other level it's like, 'Oh, the helicase unwinds the DNA.' Like just fact. It doesn't ask why, because then that gets into chemistry, like chemically why does this happen, like why does- We don't do that. So it's more like-I guess Bio, it just seems more factual to me. Like he/she kind of lectures, has us do a bunch of stuff in class to |


|  |  | try to keep us engaged, and then we just <br> memorize. And then chemistry it's more like <br> understanding along with memorizing." - <br> Lida |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Development of <br> Scientific <br> Practices | Student talks about how these ideas/concepts/topics <br> were a focused of the course because the professor <br> wanted them to be "well-rounded science students." | "Well, I mean interpreting data, I think is <br> because they want us to be more well-rounded <br> science students and know how to make a <br> claim and make sure we know how to make a <br> claim and how to support it with evidence." - <br> Lacy |
| Identified by the |  |  |
| instructor |  |  |$\quad$| "That structure determines function, and |
| :--- |
| that— What was it? chemical properties are |
| like the basis of life, I think was another one. |
| We also have talked about- (sighs) (pause) I |
| just thought of one and then I forgot it. |
| (pause) I think it's gone yeah. But a big one |
| was structure determines function, because if |
| you mess with the structure, function is gone. |
| (laughs) Yeah yeah. The two that I listed. Oh, |
| it was the chemical and physical properties of |
| life, yes. And then there is more, but I can't |
| remember them, but yes they were from my |
| professor" - Ruth |
| beginning or during the course semester. |

## S. 11 Reasons-Counts from the Interviews

| Reasoning | Chemistry | Biology | Total No. of <br> Students |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Re-occurring topics/ideas | 12 | 10 | 22 |
| Explanatory and/or predictive power | 12 | 2 | 14 |
| Time spent on topics/ideas | 9 | 5 | 14 |
| Basis of the course | 4 | 7 | 11 |
| Encompasses/Important for other concepts | 3 | 7 | 10 |
| Identified by the instructor | 0 | 7 | 7 |
| Progression of ideas | 5 | 1 | 6 |
| Personal experience | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| Need to know | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| Remembered the most | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Memorized facts | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Development of scientific practices | 0 | 1 | 1 |

## S. 12 List of Overlapping Ideas: Codebook and Counts from the Interviews

## Overlapping Ideas

Descriptions*
Total
*To stay true to students' ideas, their language was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always scientifically accurate

| Type of Bonds | Student talks about bonds/bonding or types of bonds as a <br> chemistry idea. As examples the student may or may not <br> list different types of bonding such as covalent, ionic, <br> metallic bonding, pi-bonding, sigma bonding. | 7 |
| :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Interactions | Student talks about intermolecular forces, interactions or <br> attractions. Student may or may not provide one or more <br> examples of intermolecular forces such as Dipole-dipole, <br> London dispersions, hydrogen bonding. | 7 |
| Chemistry is the basis of <br> biology | Student talks about how chemistry "drives" or is the basis <br> of everything in biology. | 6 |
| Polarity | Student talks about the polarity of molecules or the <br> electronegativity associated with atoms within a molecule. | 6 |
| Structures | Student makes a connection between what chemistry and <br> biology by listing the kind of structures they have talked <br> about and drawn in both courses. | 6 |
| Energy | Student talks about energy as a chemistry idea. The student <br> may or may not talk about types of energy such as <br> potential and kinetic and even potential energy curve. | 4 |
| Reactions | Student speaks about different reactions seen in chemistry <br> and biology. | 4 |
| Heat | Student believes heat is involved and drives reactions in <br> both disciplines. | 4 |
| Functional groups | Student talks about different functional groups that <br> characterize molecules, compounds and even <br> macromolecules. | 3 |
| Macromolecules | Student talks about how there are different types of <br> macromolecules or biomolecules, their different structures, <br> and mentioned carbohydrates, lipids, nucleic acids, and <br> proteins. | 3 |
| pH | Student talks about how pH affects multiple "things" in <br> both chemistry and biology. | 3 |
| Structure-Property <br> Relationship/Structure- <br> Function Relationship | Student talks about how both courses talk about related <br> ideas such as structure-properties and structure-function. | 3 |
| Courses are <br> complementary | Student talks about how the courses are complementary to <br> each other. | 2 |
| Micelles | Student mentions having covered concepts related to | 2 |


|  | micelles in both chemistry and biology. |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Periodic table | Student uses the periodic table to interpret the <br> characteristics (atomic size, charge) of biological systems <br> (i.e., plasma membrane). | 2 |
| Reactivity | Student talks about how atoms and molecules interact with <br> each other. | 2 |
| No connections stated | Student does not mention any connections between the <br> courses. | 2 |
| Atoms | Student talks about both courses being related to atoms. | 1 |
| Acids \& Bases | Student mentions that acids and bases are in both courses. | 1 |
| Atomic structure | Student talks about how s/he talks about the structure of <br> atoms in both courses. | 1 |
| Catalysts | Student mentions catalysts/enzymes are talked about in <br> both courses. | 1 |
| Endothermic/Exothermic <br> process | Student talks about how reactions process either absorb or <br> release energy. | 1 |
| Lipid bilayer | Student mentions talking about lipid bilayers in both <br> courses. | 1 |
| Molecules | Student talks about how both courses "dealt" with <br> molecules. | 1 |
| Mutation | Student remembers talking about mutations in both <br> courses. | 1 |
| Origins of the universe | Student speaks about how the universe originated through <br> the Big Bang theory and how this is related to both courses. | 1 |
| Oxidation-reduction | Student talks about how in both chemistry and biology they <br> encountered oxidation-reduction reactions. | 1 |
| Periodic trends | Student talks about how learning about periodic trends <br> were useful in both courses. | 1 |
| Light particles | Student talks about light "existing" as packets or photons. | 1 |
| Photosynthesis | Student talks about how reactions from chemistry power <br> photosynthesis which is a biology concept. | 1 |
| Properties of water | Student sees the importance of knowing the properties of <br> water in both subjects. | 1 |
| Relevant for Upper-level <br> courses | Student talks about how he/she thought both courses were <br> relevant to upper-level courses. | 1 |
|  | Sta | 1 |
|  |  | 1 |

## S. 13 List of Overlapping Ideas: Codebook and Counts from the Survey

Overlapping Ideas
Descriptions*
GC1/GC2 to B1 B1 to GC1/GC2
*To stay true to students' ideas, their language was used to generate each description, therefore, these are not always scientifically accurate

| No Specific Idea(s) <br> Provided | Students states not finding any <br> topics/ideas to be helpful when thinking <br> about the other course | 15 | 51 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Interactions | Student talks about intermolecular <br> forces, interactions or attractions. <br> Student may or may not provide one or <br> more examples of intermolecular forces <br> such as dipole-dipole, London <br> dispersions, hydrogen bonding. | 49 | 5 |
| Reactions | Student speaks about different reactions <br> seen in chemistry and biology. | 37 | 15 |
| Types of Bonds | Student talks about bonds/bonding or <br> types of bonds as a chemistry idea. As <br> examples the student may or may not <br> list different types of bonding such as <br> covalent, ionic, metallic bonding, pi- <br> bonding, sigma bonding. | 24 | 5 |
| Gibbs free energy | Student explicitly mentions Gibbs free <br> energy or free energy. This does not <br> include a student mentioning Gibbs free <br> energy as a description or an example <br> of what s/he thinks thermodynamics is. | 12 | 7 |
| It does not include a student talking <br> about how a reaction depends on <br> entropy and enthalpy unless they are <br> explicit about how these relate to Gibbs <br> free energy. | 72 | 11 |  |
| Energy | Student talks about how there are <br> proteins or enzymes that assist or help <br> speed up reactions in the cell. | 7 | 3 |
| Enzyme | Student talks about energy as a <br> chemistry idea. The student may talk <br> about types of energy such as potential <br> and kinetic. | ( |  |


| pH | Student talks about pH calculations and may or may not talk about $\mathrm{pKa}, \mathrm{Ka}$, and different types of concentrations of ions found in solutions to aid in calculating pH . Student may also mention the existence of a pH scale. | 7 | 8 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ATP | Student talks about ATP as the "energy source" in the cell. | 3 | 11 |
| Structures | Student makes a connection between what chemistry and biology by listing the kind of structures they have talked about and drawn in both courses. | 9 | 2 |
| Atom | Student talks about both courses being related to atoms. | 9 | 2 |
| Acids \& Bases | Student mentions that acids and bases are taught in both courses. | 6 | 3 |
| Coupled reaction | Student talks about how coupled reactions were common in both courses or how the idea of coupled reaction was introduced in one of the courses and found it to be important for the other course. | 2 | 7 |
| Polarity | Student talks about the polarity of molecules, or the electronegativity associated with atoms within a molecule. | 7 | 2 |
| Buffer | Student talks about the composition of buffers, as being made of a weak acid and conjugate base. Student may or may not refer to the carbonic anhydrase system in the blood as a type of buffer as well as the equation needed to calculate pH for buffers - HendersonHasselback. | 5 | 3 |
| Endergonic/Exergonic reaction | Student talks about reactions being endergonic and/or exergonic, or simply talks about the likeliness a reaction would occur, student may bring up the idea of reactions being spontaneous. | 3 | 5 |
| Hydrolysis | Student simply states learning about hydrolysis and may talk about it in terms of water formation. | 3 | 5 |
| Thermodynamics | Student explicitly talks about | 5 | 3 |


|  | thermodynamics, $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ can talk about heat, specific heat, temperature changes, entropy, enthalpy, heat capacity, systems, and surroundings as part of their descriptions or examples. This code does not include students that simply mentioned entropy, enthalpy or Gibbs free energy. |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rate of Reaction | Student talks about the rate of reactions. The student may talk about energy curves, reaction coordinate diagrams or activation energy to describe what $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ means by reaction rate. | 6 | 0 |
| Structure-Function | Student describes or talks about how the structures of molecules/organelle determines its function. | 0 | 6 |
| Amino acids | Student talks about how amino acids link to form proteins or how proteins are made of amino acids. | 0 | 5 |
| Bond energy | Student specifically talks about the energy associated with breaking or forming a bond. | 4 | 1 |
| Catalyst | Student mentions catalysts/enzymes being talked about in both courses. | 3 | 2 |
| Cell/Cell structure | Students mentions studying the cell as a whole. For example, how cells functions. | 0 | 5 |
| Charge | Student talks about molecules/atoms having or "holding" either a positive or negative charge. | 5 | 0 |
| Endothermic/Exothermic reaction | Student talks about reactions or processes that either absorb or release energy. | 2 | 3 |
| Molecules | Student talks about learning about different types of molecules. | 2 | 3 |
| Proteins | Student talks about structures and different structural features of proteins. | 1 | 4 |
| Reaction mechanisms | Student talks about knowing the way reactions occur. | 4 | 1 |
| System | Student talks about closed and open systems independently of thermodynamics. | 4 | 2 |


| DNA/RNA | Student talks about the structure, formation, and/ or function of DNA and/or RNA. | 0 | 5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Element | Student simply mentions learning about different to types of elements. | 2 | 2 |
| Formal charge | Student talks about how they learn to determine the formal charges in the class. | 2 | 2 |
| Hydrophilic/Hydrophobic | Student talks about entities either being hydrophilic or hydrophobic. | 2 | 3 |
| Lipids | Student talks about having learned about different type of lipids and how these were also important when thinking about the cell membrane. | 0 | 4 |
| Oxidation-Reduction | Student talks about how in both chemistry and biology they encountered oxidation-reduction reactions. | 3 | 1 |
| Solution | Student talks about solutions as an important concept in the courses. | 4 | 0 |
| Carbon dating | Student talks about how carbon dating was useful for them to understand other ideas in the courses. | 1 | 2 |
| Forces | Student talks about how forces are important to understand in the course. | 3 | 0 |
| Functional group | Students talks about how different functional groups that characterize molecules, compounds and even macromolecules. | 2 | 1 |
| Photosynthesis | Student describes this process as how energy comes from the sun is "processed" by the plants, suggesting that energy is neither created nor destroyed. | 1 | 2 |
| Structure-Property <br> Relationship | Student describes how the structures of molecules determines the properties of molecules. | 2 | 1 |
| Cell respiration | Student could talk about glycolysis or the production of ATP; Energy cycles, suggesting that energy is neither created nor destroyed. Student speaks about other processes involved in cellular respiration such as citric acid | 1 | 1 |


|  | cycle/Krebs cycle. |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Enthalpy | Student talks about changes in enthalpy of a reaction as a chemistry idea. Student could simply list or mention delta $H$ as an idea. This does not include a student mentioning enthalpy as a description or an example of what $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ thinks thermodynamics is. | 2 | 0 |
| Entropy | Student talks about changes in entropy of a reaction as a chemistry idea. Student could simply list or mention delta S as an idea. This does not include a student mentioning enthalpy as a description or an example of what $\mathrm{s} / \mathrm{he}$ thinks thermodynamics is. | 2 | 0 |
| Macromolecules | Student talks about how there are different types of macromolecules or biomolecules, their different structures, and mentioned carbohydrates, lipids, nucleic acids, and proteins. | 0 | 2 |
| Activation energy | Student talks about the minimum about of energy required for a reaction to take place. | 1 | 0 |
| Atomic structure | Student talks about the electronic structure of the atom and how in the center of the atom is made of protons and neutrons or nucleus. The student did not specify an atomic model and did not describe a specific atomic model. | 1 | 0 |
| Cell communication/signaling | Student talks about how cells have "ways" or process by which they communicate within and outside of the cell. | 0 | 1 |
| Cell cycle/division | Student talks about lifecycle of the cell and how it's broken into three phases: G1, the S phase, and G2. | 0 | 1 |
| Cell membrane | Student talks about cell membrane and some properties of membranes such as their permeability. | 0 | 1 |
| Environment | Student mentions how learning about multiple environments was important to | 1 | 0 |


|  | for biology. |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Equilibrium | Student talks about reactions having or <br> reaching equilibrium. Student may also <br> state that it equals to the rate of forward <br> over the backwards rate of a reactions. | 1 | 0 |
| Ester linkages | Student simply states that learning <br> about ester linkages in biology was <br> useful when thinking about chemistry. | 0 | 1 |
| Types of cells: | Student talks about how there are <br> different type of cells such as animal <br> Eukaryotic \& Prokaryotic <br> and plant cells, differences between <br> prokaryotic and eukaryotic cells. | 0 | 1 |
| Heat | Students believes heat is involved and <br> drives reactions in both disciplines. | 1 | 0 |
| Homeostasis | Student simply states how learning <br> about homeostasis in chemistry was <br> important for biology. | 1 | 0 |
| Kinetics | Student talks about how learning about <br> kinetics was useful for biology. | 1 | 0 |
| Law of matter | Student talks about how the "law of <br> matter" was important when thinking <br> about biology. | 1 | 0 |
| Le Chatelier's Principle | Student talks about how learning about <br> Le Chatelier's principle is important for <br> the other course. | 0 | 1 |
| Sub-atomic particles | Student talks about how having an <br> understand of subatomic particles like <br> protons, electrons, and neutrons is <br> important for biology. | 1 | 0 |
| Structure modifications | Student simply states that learning <br> about orbitals was useful when thinking <br> about biology. | Student talks about how modifying a <br> structure could lead to differences in <br> "behavior." | 1 |


[^0]:    ** $\mathrm{U}=41260.50, \mathrm{z}=-1.24, \mathrm{p}=0.214$

