## Supplemental Material

CBE—Life Sciences Education
Hsu et al.

Supporting information for Hsu et al., "Investigating the influence of assessment question framing on undergraduate biology student preference and affect"

Table of contents
Supplemental tables... pages 3-7
ANOVA results... page 8
End of semester survey... page 9

Supplemental table 1. Demographic data for the three sections. No students identified as non-binary. Given that students could select more than box for race or ethnicity, the percents sum up to greater than 100\%.

| Section | Number participating (percent of class) | Gender | Major | Class year | Percent <br> first- <br> generation <br> students | Percent <br> transfer <br> student <br> S | Race or ethnicity |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 29 (53.7\%) | 69.0\% <br> female; 31.0\% <br> male | 44.8\% Health Sciences; <br> 17.2\% Applied <br> Human <br> Physiology; <br> 17.2\% pre- <br> pharmacy; <br> 13.8\% <br> Biochemistry; <br> 6.9\% Biology | 69.0\% first <br> years; <br> 13.7\% <br> second <br> years; <br> 17.2\% <br> third <br> years; 0\% <br> fourth <br> years | 17.2\% | 10.7\% | 51.7\% <br> Asian; <br> 51.7\% <br> White; <br> 6.9\% <br> LatinX; <br> 3.4\% <br> Black |
| 2 | 51 (92.7\%) | 90.2\% <br> female; <br> 9.8\% <br> male | 38\% pre- <br> pharmacy; <br> 30\% Health <br> Sciences; 12\% <br> Biochemistry; <br> 8\% Applied <br> Human <br> Physiology; <br> 6\% Chemistry; <br> 2\% Biology; <br> 2\% <br> Environmental <br> Science and <br> Policy; 2\% <br> Math | 78.4\% first <br> years; <br> 15.7\% <br> second <br> years; <br> 3.9\% third <br> years; <br> 1.9\% <br> fourth <br> years | 17.6\% | 5.8\% | 56.9\% <br> Asian; <br> 29.4\% <br> White; <br> 15.7\% <br> LatinX; <br> 2.0\% <br> Native <br> Hawaiian or Pacific Islander |
| 3 | 42 (79.3\%) | $71.4 \%$ <br> female; 28.6\% male | 50.0\% Health sciences; 14.3\% prepharmacy; 16.7\% <br> Biochemistry; <br> 11.9\% Biology; <br> 7.1\% Applied <br> Human <br> Physiology | 73.8\% first years; 9.5\% second years; 11.9\% third years; 4.8\% fourth years | 29.3\% | 14.3\% | 47.6\% <br> Asian; <br> 45.2\% <br> White; <br> 26.2\% <br> LatinX |

Supplemental table 2. Student performance across section and assessments; quiz and exam scores are reported as percents, given that the relative point values differed between these. The mean percent is reported with standard deviation in parentheses.

|  | Section 1 | Section 2 | Section 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Quiz 1 | $79.7 \%(15.7 \%)$ | $80.8 \%(17.7 \%)$ | $79.1 \%(13.8 \%)$ |
| Exam 1 | $78.2 \%(19.1 \%)$ | $81.0 \%(15.0 \%)$ | $80.4 \%(14.5 \%)$ |
| Quiz 2 | $73.7 \%(20.1 \%)$ | $77.4 \%(17.0 \%)$ | $75.5 \%(18.0 \%)$ |
| Exam 2 | $69.0 \%(19.1 \%)$ | $75.7 \%(18.6 \%)$ | $73.5 \%(17.0 \%)$ |
| Quiz 3 | $70.0 \%(18.0 \%)$ | $78.8 \%(16.0 \%)$ | $75.4 \%(16.7 \%)$ |

Supplemental table 3. Means for sense of belonging and identity reflection in beginning of semester baseline survey.

| Section number | Sense of belonging | Identity reflection |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | $4.03(0.68)$ | $3.75(0.64)$ |
| 2 | $3.76(0.81)$ | $3.41(0.82)$ |
| 3 | $3.76(0.82)$ | $3.45(0.80)$ |

Supplemental table 4. Average scores for stress by section (standard deviation in parentheses).

| Section <br> number | Assessment <br> framing <br> variant | Quiz 1 | Exam 1 | Quiz 2 | Exam 2 | Quiz 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Authentic | $2.41(0.97)$ | $2.62(1.21)$ | $2.48(0.99)$ | $2.20(0.96)$ | $2.83(1.06)$ |
| 2 | Self-referential | $2.43(0.91)$ | $2.33(0.89)$ | $2.60(1.0)$ | $2.30(1.04)$ | $2.50(0.98)$ |
| 3 | Classmate <br> referential | $2.57(0.99)$ | $2.61(0.95)$ | $2.54(0.89)$ | $2.52(0.88)$ | $2.72(0.90)$ |

Supplemental table 5. Average scores for identity by section (standard deviation in parentheses)

| Section <br> number | Assessment <br> framing <br> variant | Quiz 1 | Exam 1 | Quiz 2 | Exam 2 | Quiz 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Authentic | $3.57(0.84)$ | $3.61(0.74)$ | $3.49(0.72)$ | $3.45(0.66)$ | $3.77(0.66)$ |
| 2 | Self-referential | $3.38(0.88)$ | $3.57(0.77)$ | $3.47(0.80)$ | $3.45(0.66)$ | $3.54(0.67)$ |
| 3 | Classmate <br> referential | $3.60(0.81)$ | $3.75(0.80)$ | $3.48(0.77)$ | $3.41(0.85)$ | $3.60(0.82)$ |

Supplemental table 6. Average scores for stress by preferred variant (standard deviation in parentheses).

| Assessment <br> framing <br> variant <br> preference | Quiz 1 | Exam 1 | Quiz 2 | Exam 2 | Quiz 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Authentic | $2.80(0.16)$ | $2.75(0.16)$ | $2.88(0.19)$ | $2.56(0.20)$ | $2.80(0.18)$ |
| Self-referential | $2.37(0.09)$ | $2.37(0.09)$ | $2.48(0.10)$ | $2.20(0.09)$ | $2.49(0.09)$ |
| Classmate <br> referential | $3.00(0.24)$ | $2.82(0.14)$ | $2.90(0.14)$ | $2.61(0.20)$ | $2.61(0.17)$ |

Supplemental table 7. Average scores for identity by preferred variant (standard deviation in parentheses)

| Assessment <br> framing <br> variant <br> preference | Quiz 1 | Exam 1 | Quiz 2 | Exam 2 | Quiz 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Authentic | $3.70(0.10)$ | $3.64(0.07)$ | $3.50(0.07)$ | $3.41(0.09)$ | $3.66(0.08)$ |
| Self-referential | $3.51(0.06)$ | $3.66(0.04)$ | $3.55(0.04)$ | $3.52(0.04)$ | $3.72(0.04)$ |
| Classmate <br> referential | $3.88(0.16)$ | $3.95(0.08)$ | $3.74(0.08)$ | $3.52(0.10)$ | $3.81(0.10)$ |

Supplemental table 8. Code frequencies for students' reasoning for why they preferred a certain variant, separated by student preferences. Only codes at $5 \%$ or more frequency in at least one of the sections are included.

| Code name | Percent of <br> responses from <br> students <br> preferring <br> authentic variant | Percent of <br> responses from <br> students <br> preferring self- <br> referential <br> variant | $\underline{\text { Percent of }}$responses from <br> students <br> preferring <br> classmate <br> referential variant |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Easy to read | $30.0 \%$ | $54.7 \%$ | $16.7 \%$ |
| Visualizatio <br> n | $25.0 \%$ | $25.0 \%$ | $25.0 \%$ |
| Less <br> complexity <br> is good | $0 \%$ | $10.0 \%$ | $26.6 \%$ |
| Fewer <br> words | $10.0 \%$ | $26.6 \%$ | $8.3 \%$ |
| Identity | $0 \%$ | $12.5 \%$ | $33.3 \%$ |
| Distraction <br> due to <br> names | $0 \%$ | $12.5 \%$ | $0 \%$ |
| No <br> preferences <br> or major <br> differences | $5.0 \%$ | $0 \%$ | $0 \%$ |
| More <br> complexity <br> is good | $25.0 \%$ | $0 \%$ | $8.3 \%$ |
| Authentic | $25.0 \%$ | $0 \%$ | 8 |
| Similarity to <br> past exams | $15.0 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $8.3 \%$ |
| Stereotype <br> threat | $5.0 \%$ | $0 \%$ | $16.7 \%$ |

Supplemental table 9. Code frequencies for students' reasoning for why they least preferred a certain variant, separated by student preferences. Only codes at $5 \%$ or more frequency in at least one of the sections are included.

| Code name | Percent of responses from <br> students preferring authentic variant | Percent of responses from students preferring selfreferential variant | Percent of responses from <br> students <br> preferring <br> classmate <br> referential variant |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| More complexity is bad | 47.3\% | 0\% | 31.3\% |
| Length | 19.1\% | 0\% | 50.0\% |
| Less authentic | 7.1\% | 13.3\% | 28.1\% |
| No preferences or major changes | 0\% | 0\% | 0\% |
| Distraction due to names | 14.3\% | 0\% | 12.5\% |
| Intimidation of real study or scientist | 19.1\% | 0\% | 0\% |
| Less connected (identity) | 11.9\% | 6.7\% | 3.1\% |
| Hard to visualize | 0\% | 26.7\% | 6.3\% |
| Similarity to class and past exams | 2.4\% | 6.7\% | 0\% |
| Stereotype threat | 0\% | 13.3\% | 0\% |
| Less <br> complexity <br> is bad | 0\% | 6.7\% | 0\% |

## ANOVA results

| ANOVA comparison | df (between groups, within groups) | F value | Sig |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Quiz 1 across the three sections | 2,112 | 0.12 | 0.88 |
| Exam 1 across the three sections | 2,112 | 0.28 | 0.75 |
| Quiz 2 across the three sections | 2,112 | 0.36 | 0.70 |
| Exam 2 across the three sections | 2,112 | 1.22 | 0.30 |
| Quiz 3 across the three sections | 2,112 | 2.54 | 0.08 |
| Combined assessment scores across the three sections. | 2,112 | 0.90 | 0.41 |
| Beginning of semester survey, stress | 2,149 | 1.39 | 0.25 |
| Beginning of semester survey, identity | 2,149 | 2.30 | 0.11 |
| During semester surveys, stress, quiz 1 | 2,259 | 0.70 | 0.50 |
| During semester surveys, stress, exam 1 | 2,243 | 2.4 | 0.09 |
| During semester surveys, stress, quiz 2 | 2,215 | 0.30 | 0.77 |
| During semester surveys, stress, exam 2 | 2,221 | 2.2 | 0.12 |
| During semester surveys, stress, quiz 3 | 2,201 | 2.0 | 0.14 |
| During semester surveys, identity, quiz 1 | 2,381 | 2.9 | 0.059 |
| During semester surveys, identity, exam 1 | 2,732 | 4.1 | 0.018 |
| During semester surveys, identity, quiz 2 | 2,651 | 0.05 | 0.95 |
| During semester surveys, identity, exam 2 | 2,669 | 0.26 | 0.77 |
| During semester surveys, identity, quiz 3 | 2,608 | 4.5 | 0.012 |

## End of semester survey

1. Please read the three versions of the same question above. After reading all three versions, which of these versions would you prefer when taking a quiz/exam?
[Choices: version $A$, version $B$, and version $C$; students were provided the three examples listed in table 1]
2. Explain your reasoning for which choice you would most prefer when taking a quiz or exam. Please be as detailed as possible.
3. Which of these versions would you LEAST prefer when taking a quiz/exam?
[Choices: version $A$, version $B$, and version $C$ ]
4. Explain your reasoning for which choice you would LEAST prefer when taking a quiz or exam. Please be as detailed as possible.
