Supplemental Material CBE—Life Sciences Education

Edwards et al.

Supplementary Materials:

2	This supplement contains the following:	
3	Item	Page
4 5	Copy of survey questions analyzed	2 - 5
6	Copy of interview questions	6 - 7
7 8 9	Copy of codebook used for qualitative analysis	8 – 12
10 11 12 13	Participant demographics table	13 – 14
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		
30		
31		
32		

33	Additional File 1: Copy of Survey Questions Analyzed:
34	Religious Affiliation:
35	I most closely identify as:
36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45	 Buddhist Christian (for example, Catholic, Protestant, Orthodox, CJD-LDS, nondenominational) Hindu Jewish Muslim I don't identify with a religion (for example, atheist or agnostic) Option not available, please describe Decline to state If "Christian" is chosen:
46	With what denomination of Christianity do you most closely identify?
47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60	 Catholic Jehovah's Witness Orthodox Nondenominational Protestant (for example, Baptist, Methodist, Pentecostal, Lutheran, Presbyterian) The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Option not available, please describe Decline to state Religiosity: Please indicate how much you agree or disagree with the following statements: I attend religious services regularly (when they are available).
61 62 63 64 65 66 67	 Strongly disagree Disagree Neutral Agree Strongly agree I believe in God.
68 69 70 71	 Strongly disagree Disagree Neutral Agree

72 73	• Strongly agree
74	I consider myself a religious person.
75 76 77 78 79 80 81	 Strongly disagree Disagree Neutral Agree Strongly agree I consider myself a spiritual person.
82 83 84 85 86 87 88	 Strongly disagree Disagree Neutral Agree Strongly agree Year in School:
89	What is your year in school?
90 91 92 93	 First/sophomore Junior/Senior Postgraduate Decline to state
94	Biology Major:
95 96 97	Is your major in biology? (includes biomedical sciences, biology and society, conservation biology, genetics, neurobiology/physiology/behavior, microbiology, medical microbiology, molecular bioscience, neuroscience)
98 99	YesNo
100	Intended Career:
101	What is your intended career?
102 103 104 105 106 107	 Healthcare professionals (examples include Physician, Nurse, EMT). Please describe: Research scientist (examples include Professor, Biologist, Chemist, Zoologist, Physicist Geologist): Please describe: Option not available. Please describe: Decline to state

108	Parent Education Level:					
109 110	What is your parents' highest completed level of education? If you have more than one pare with differing levels of education, choose the higher of the two.					
111 112 113 114 115 116 117 118	 Less than high school completed High school diploma or GED Some college but no degree Associate degree (for example: AA, AS) Bachelor's degree (for example: BA, AB, BS) Master's degree (for example: MA, MS, MEng, MEd, MSW, MBA) Higher than a Master's degree (for example: PhD, MD, JD) Decline to state 					
119	Gender:					
120	I most closely identify as:					
121 122 123 124 125	 Woman Man Nonbinary Please describe your gender identity if the best option is not listed: Decline to state 					
126	Race:					
127	Choose the race/ethnicity with which you most closely identify:					
128 129 130 131 132 133 134 135 136	 American Indian, Native America, or Alaskan Native Asian (Middle Eastern, East Asian, Southeast Asian, South Asian, West Asian) Black or African American Hispanic or Latinx Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander White Multiracial (please describe your multiple racial/ethnic identities) Option not available, please describe: Decline to state 					
137	Political Affiliation:					
138	Please indicate your political identity:					
139 140 141 142 143	 Extremely Liberal Liberal Slightly Liberal Moderate Slightly Conservative 					

- Conservative
- Extremely Conservative
- Decline to state

View of Evolution:

There are no right or wrong answers to this question. Please indicate which of the following statements most closely represents your personal view, **based on your personal opinion**:

- All forms of life were first brought into being in their present form by God 6,000-10,000 years ago at the same time. (Young Earth creationism)
- All forms of life were first brought into being in their present form by God at different times over billions of years. (Old Earth creationism)
- Some forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but God created groups of organisms such as reptiles, birds, mammals, and humans separate from one another and organisms that currently exist have evolved slowly from those first creations. (Creationism with some evolution)
- Almost all forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but humans were created by God in their present form separate from the rest of life. (*Humans only creationism*)
- All forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but God intervenes from time to shape or override evolution. (*Interventionist evolution*)
- All forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but God set up evolution from the start in a perfect way so that it would fulfill God's purpose and no subsequent intervention was necessary. (*Theistic evolution*)
- All forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but life and evolution were first set in motion by God without a specific purpose or plan. (*Deistic evolution*)
- All forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but I'm not sure whether any God was involved in evolution. (Agnostic evolution)
- All forms of life evolved from earlier forms, but no God has ever played a role in evolution. (Atheistic evolution)

*The italicized text in parentheses is the technical label of the evolution view that corresponds with each statement. The italicized text was not included on the official survey, but it is included here for readers' reference.

Additional File 2: Copy of Interview Questions:

183 1. Talk to me a bit about your religious identity.

- When you are interacting with peers in your biology courses, are you ever reminded of your religious identity?
 - 3. Do you ever consider your religious identity when choosing who to sit by in class?
- 4. Talk to me about what you perceive are the potential benefits of being religious when interacting your peers in your biology courses, particularly during peer discussion.
 - 5. Talk to me about what you perceive are the potential disadvantages are of being religious when interacting with your peers in your biology courses, particularly during peer discussion.
 - 6. To what extent do you reveal that you are religious to students in your biology courses?
 - 7. Can you tell me about instances in your biology courses when you have had the chance to reveal to your peers that you are religious, but decided not to?
 - 8. Can you tell me about instances when you *have* revealed that you are religious to one of your peers in your biology courses?
 - 9. How do you decide whether or not to tell a peer in your biology courses that you are religious?
 - 10. Talk to me about the potential risks you see, if any, of revealing your religious identity to other students in your biology classes.
 - 11. Talk to me about the potential benefits you see, if any, of revealing your religious identity to other students in your biology classes.
 - 12. Compared to a traditional lecture course, do you feel like there are more opportunities to reveal your religious identity in courses that incorporate peer discussion?
 - 13. If you were to tell a peer in your biology courses that you are religious, would you worry about what they would think about you? Why or why not?
 - 14. Are there particular ways you talk about your religious identity with your peers to avoid any negative perceptions?
 - 15. Have any of your peers in your biology courses ever done anything that made you feel like they did not value you as a person who is religious?
 - 16. Have any of your peers in your biology courses ever done anything that made you think they *did* value you as a person who is religious?
 - 17. How would you feel if another student revealed to you that they were religious during a discussion in your biology course?
 - a. Would your feelings depend on whether someone had the same religious identity than you?
 - b. How do you think these feelings compare to how you would feel if another student revealed that they are an Atheist?
 - 18. How does your religious identity influence your comfort level when you are interacting with your peers, particularly during peer discussion?

221	a. Are there any topics that you would feel less comfortable discussing because of
222	your religious identity?
223	i. Like what?
224	19. Logic question:
225	a. If they said they have revealed: To what extent do you feel
226	b. If they said they have not revealed: To what extent do you think you would fee
227	i. comfortable in a peer discussion where you have revealed that you are
228	religious to at least one other person?
229	20. Is there anything else you would like to talk about related to your experiences as a
230	religious student during peer discussions in your biology courses?
231	
232	
233	
234	
235	
236	
237	
238	
239	
240	
241	
242	
243	
244	
245	
246	
247	
248	
249	
250	
251	
252	
253	
254	
255	
256	
257	
258	
259	
260	

Additional File 3: Copy of Codebook Used for Qualitative Analysis:

Salience:

- a) **Specific topics:** Student explains that their religious identity is more salient when they are discussing particular topics with their peers that may conflict with their identity or topics for which their opinions are partially shaped by their religion such as evolution, genetics, or bioethics topics.
- b) **Differences among students:** Student explains that their religious identity is more salient when they are interacting with their peers and are reminded that their views or behaviors are different from their peers' due to their religious identity.
- c) Awe at creation: Student says they are reminded of their religious identity when they are discussing a science topic that they perceive to be incredibly intricate or impressive because it reminds them that their creator made everything and is amazing
- d) **Not reminded:** Student says their religious identity is never especially salient when they are interacting with their peers.
 - I. **Silo religion and science:** Student says that when they are talking with their peers, they keep science separate from their religion. Student may say they try to think about the science itself rather than thinking about what their religion would say about it.

Benefits of being religious:

- b) **More open-minded:** Student states that one benefit of being religious is that they are more open-minded, respectful, or empathetic when hearing their peers' views.
- a) **Passion for Biology:** Student explains that one benefit of being religious is that their religion increases their enthusiasm, appreciation, or passion for biology.
- b) **Different perspective:** Student says that one benefit of being religious is that they add unique perspectives to conversations in biology courses because of their religious background.
- c) Already considered their views: Student says that one benefit of being religious is that, because of their religious identity, they have already deeply thought about their views on many potentially controversial issues that come up in class and may know what they think about those topics already. Student may also say that students who are not religious may not have thought about their views on those topics until they were brought up in class.

Disadvantages of being religious:

- a) **Stereotypes:** Student says that one disadvantage of being religious is that if their peers find out about their religious identities, they may make assumptions about the student and associate them with stereotypes of religious people or judge them.
- b) Closed-minded peers: Student says that one disadvantage of being religious is their peers may be unwilling to listen to them, be closed-minded towards them, or be confrontational if they find out they were religious.

- c) **Difficulty relating to peers:** Student says that one disadvantage of being religious is that because they are religious and they perceive most of their students are not, many of their peers think or behave differently than they do, which can make it difficult to connect with them.
- d) **Making other students feel uncomfortable:** Student says that one disadvantage of being religious is that their being religious may make other students in the class feel uncomfortable. Student may mention that their peers' discomfort could stem from their past personal experiences with religion/religious people or the assumptions that they may make about religious people's attitudes or behaviors.

Tendency to Reveal:

- a) Never or rarely because of (anticipated stigma): Student says that they rarely or never reveal their religious identity to peers in their biology classes depending on the person and situation because they have concerns about what their peer would think of them if they were to reveal.
- b) **Never or rarely because no opportunities:** Student says they never or rarely reveal their religious identity in their biology class because there are not opportunities. The student does not say that they would reveal if they could.
- c) Freely: Student says that they freely reveal their religious identity to peers in their biology classes any time it feels relevant or comes up in conversation.
 - I. **Reveals Frequently:** Student says that they frequently reveal their religious identity in their biology classes.
 - II. **Reveals Rarely:** Student says that they rarely reveal their religious identity in their biology classes because they do not have the opportunity to do so, but they say that they would reveal if they did have the opportunity to.

Reveal or conceal:

- a) **Open-mindedness of peer:** Student says that they would be willing to reveal if their peer seems like they are open-minded or nice or would be willing to listen to or be respectful of their perspective OR student says they would not be willing to reveal if their peers seemed closed-minded or unwilling to respectfully listen to their perspective.
- b) **Relevance to discussion:** Student says that they would be willing to reveal if it seemed relevant to the discussion they were having with their peers OR student says that they would not be willing to reveal if doing so meant bringing their religious identity up out of nowhere when it was not relevant to the conversation.
- c) Closeness with peer: Student says that they would be willing to reveal if they knew the peer or were friends with them OR student says they would not be willing to reveal if they had just met the peer or hardly knew them.
- d) **Other peer is religious:** Student says that they would reveal they were religious if their peers revealed that they were religious first.
- e) **Opportunity to evangelize:** Student says that they would reveal they were religious because it may help others to become religious. Student may say it brings them joy or

helps them fulfill their duty as a Christian to talk about their religion with those who are not religious. Student may also mention they could invite their peers to church or answer any questions they have about religion if they reveal that they are religious.

Anticipated Stigma:

- a) **Stereotypes:** Student says that if a peer knew they were religious, they may stereotype, judge, or make false assumptions about them based on their religious identity.
 - I. **Don't believe in science:** Student says that they think many individuals would assume that they don't believe in science or some aspect of it, like evolution.
 - II. **Less scientifically capable:** Student says that they think many individuals would discredit them or assume they are less of a scientist or less capable of being a scientist than nonreligious individuals
 - III. **No free will:** Student says that they think many individuals would assume that they cannot make decisions for themselves or are required to do and say things because of their religion.
 - IV. **Judgmental or closed-minded:** Student says that they think many individuals would assume that they are judgmental of other people or closed-minded about the views of others.
 - V. **Denomination specific stereotypes:** Student mentions that they think many individuals would make assumptions about them based on their specific denomination of Christianity. For example, a student who is LDS may say they think that people assume they get have many children or that the men have multiple wives, or a student who is Catholic may say they think people might assume they are a bad person because of the views and behaviors associated with the faith, like pedophilia or homophobia.
 - VI. **Convert:** Student says that they think many individuals would assume that they are always attempting to convert their peers or people they interact with.
 - VII. **Naïve:** Student says that they think many individuals would assume they are naïve because of their faith or turn a blind eye to fact and truth.
- b) **Social repercussions:** Student says they may lose friends or be excluded from peer groups or working groups because of their religious identity. Student may also say their peers may dislike them or think less of them if they knew they were religious or be less willing to interact with them.
- c) **Confrontation:** Student says that if their peers knew they were religious, it could lead to arguments, confrontation, or tension with them.

Experienced Stigma:

a) **Positive/neutral experience:** Student says that when they revealed they were religious to a peer, the experience was positive or neutral.

- b) **Assumed incompatibility of religion and science:** Student says that their peers express shock or surprise at the idea that someone can be religious and accept science.
- c) Jokes/negative comments about religious people: Student says that peers in their biology courses have made jokes or negative comments about religious people during class.
- d) **Mention anticipated stigma despite no experienced stigma:** Student explicitly recognizes and mentions that they realize that they anticipate stigma from their peers due to their religious identity even though they have never actually experienced stigma.
- e) Never experienced stigma: Student says that they have never experienced stigma during discussions with their peers because of their religious identity.

Impression management strategies:

- a) **Doesn't push religion on others:** Student says that when they reveal they are religious, they will do so in a way that allows their peer to decide if they want to continue the discussion or not, or they try not to bring their religion up in discussion at all.
- b) **Discusses casually:** Student says they discuss their religion in a casual way so it doesn't seem like a big deal to their peers, or student says they will bring up the commonly accepted ideals of their religion but not the more controversial ones. For instance, students may say they go to church but not reveal more details about their specific religious beliefs. Student may also say they will bring religion up in a relaxed or simple way.
- c) **Speak positively about religion:** Student says that they talk about their religion in a positive way or highlights what they like about their religion to avoid negative perceptions.
- d) **Self-group distancing/assimilating:** Student reveals in a way that separates themselves from the stereotypes typically associated with religious individuals.
 - I. **Accepts science:** Student reveals that they are religious but makes it clear that they also accept science.
 - II. **Has individual thought:** Student reveals they are religious but discusses it carefully to make it clear that they think deeply about their faith and have free will regarding what they do and believe.
 - III. **Politics:** Student reveals that they are Christian but says that they are politically liberal or progressive.
 - IV. **Different than their religion:** Student emphasize that they do not agree with some of the sentiments and behavior of their church or religion, its leaders, or its followers. Students may say they believe in foundational ideals like loving one another but disagree with more controversial ideas typically associated with the faith.

Benefits of revealing:

- a) **Finding other religious students:** Student says that a benefit of revealing to their peers is that they may find other students who are also religious because they feel similar to them.
- b) **Religion and science coexisting:** Student says that a benefit of revealing is that they can show their peers, both those who are religious or nonreligious, that people can be religious and believe in science.
- c) Others reveal: Student says that a benefit of revealing is that their peers may also feel comfortable enough to reveal their own religious identity.
- d) **Increases closeness with peers:** Student says that a benefit of revealing is that their peers can get to know them better and they may grow closer from the vulnerability of revealing.

Opportunities to reveal:

- a) Yes: Student says that they do think there are more opportunities to reveal their religious identity in courses that incorporate peer discussion.
 - I. **Increased discussion:** Student says that they do think there are more opportunities to reveal because with increased discussion with peers comes increased opportunity for things like religious identity to come up or be shared.
 - II. Closer relationships: Student says that they do think there are more opportunities to reveal because increased discussion means students are more likely to get close to each other, so they would be more likely to share personal information like religion. Student may say this is especially the case when they have discussions with the same peers throughout the semester.
 - III. **Small group:** Student says that they do think there are more opportunities to reveal because they are in smaller groups so people may be more likely to share that they are religious in those settings or may feel more comfortable doing so.
- b) **No, religion is not relevant:** Student says that they do not think there are more opportunities to reveal their religious identity because even when students are talking to each other, religion still is not relevant to the conversation, so it does not come up.

Additional File 4: Participant Demographics Tables:

463

Table S1. Each participant's religious denomination, religiosity, view of evolution, year in school, race, and political identity.

Pseudonym	Christian Denomination	Religiosity	View of Evolution	Year in School	Race	Political Identity
Jamie	Nondenominational	3.5	Theistic evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Moderate
Molly	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	4.75	Interventionist evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Slightly conservative
Megan	Catholic	3.5	Agnostic evolution	First year/Sophomore	Hispanic or Latinx	Extremely liberal
Daniel	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	4.75	Theistic evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Conservative
Grace	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	5	Theistic evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Slightly liberal
Ira	Nondenominational	2.75	Interventionist evolution	First year/Sophomore	Asian	Liberal
Peter	Nondenominational	3.5	Old Earth Creationism	First year/Sophomore	Asian	Slightly conservative
Melody	Catholic	4.25	Agnostic evolution	Junior/Senior	Hispanic or Latinx	Liberal
Erin	Catholic	4.75	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	Hispanic or Latinx	Slightly conservative
Sofia	Protestant	3.5	Human only creationism	First year/Sophomore	Hispanic or Latinx	Moderate
Maria	Nondenominational	4	Theistic evolution	Junior/Senior	Hispanic or Latinx	Extremely liberal
Connor	Nondenominational	4.5	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	White	Moderate
Allan	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	5	Young Earth creationism	Junior/Senior	White	Conservative
Trinity	Nondenominational	4.5	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	Asian	Slightly liberal

_						
Lori	Nondenominational	5	Creationism with some evolution	Junior/Senior	Asian	Conservative
Brooke	Nondenominational	3.75	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	White	Slightly liberal
Camila	Catholic	4.25	Deistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	White	Liberal
Brandon	Catholic	4	Creationism with some evolution	First year/Sophomore	Hispanic or Latinx	Liberal
Erica	Protestant	4	Deistic evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Slightly conservative
Javier	Catholic	4.5	Theistic evolution	Junior/Senior	Hispanic or Latinx	Liberal
Macie	Nondenominational	1	Human only creationism	First year/Sophomore	White	Slightly conservative
Iris	Nondenominational	4.75	Young Earth creationism	First year/Sophomore	Multiracial	Liberal
Julia	Catholic	4.5	Agnostic evolution	Junior/Senior	Hispanic or Latinx	Liberal
Levi	Protestant	4.5	Old Earth Creationism	First year/Sophomore	White	Conservative
Luke	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	5	Creationism with some evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Conservative
Diego	Catholic	5	Deistic evolution	Junior/Senior	Hispanic or Latinx	Moderate
Olivia	Nondenominational	4.5	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	Hispanic or Latinx	Liberal
Gabby	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	3.75	Theistic evolution	First year/Sophomore	White	Moderate
Amie	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	4.25	Creationism with some evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Moderate
Kristin	The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints	5	Creationism with some evolution	Junior/Senior	White	Slightly liberal